

Generative Democracy

New Foundations for Democratic Theory

Franz Dietrich and Kai Spiekermann

in preparation for *Oxford University Press*

provisional abstract and table of contents

July 2026

Abstract

This book presents a new framework for democratic theory and institutional design, directed at political theorists, philosophers, economists, and others. In this framework, a value theory of institutions has three layers: a principle of evaluation, an analysis of institutions, and a resulting evaluation of institutions. Armed with this framework, we recast established approaches, such as Proceduralism, Instrumentalism, and Epistemism, as value theories of institutions. We identify a fundamental dilemma for institutional design: should one focus on how institutions fit people's psychology, or on how institutions change people's psychology? Current theorising and modelling lean to the former, often ignoring psychological change altogether. However, psychological reactions to institutions are central causes of institutional failures and the current 'democratic crisis'. Theorising and modelling cannot ignore this. We thus introduce a new theory for evaluating and ultimately choosing institutions: Generativism. Generativism takes psychological reactions seriously when assessing the performance of institutions. This leads to a 'generative' defence of democracy: suitably designed democratic social orders induce more fruitful mental changes than rival social orders. We also present a formal analysis that shows how mental change can be incorporated into models of institutions. After defining a general formal framework for evaluating institutions, we present generative versions of two established research programmes: mechanism design theory in economics and epistemic social choice theory.

Contents

Introduction	7
1 Introduction and Overview	7
1.1 The Democratic Crisis	8
1.2 Democratic Theory in Need for a Response	9
1.3 Institutions are not external tools	9
1.4 The Generative View of Institutions	12
1.5 Overview of Chapters	15
1.6 For Readers in a Hurry	19
1.7 Acknowledgements	20
I The Social Order and Its Institutions	21
2 What are Social Orders and Institutions?	21
2.1 Social Orders	21
2.2 Institutions	24
2.3 A first glimpse into the universe of institutions	28
3 Explicitly created institutions	29
3.1 Political institutions: system, voting procedures, deliberation formats	29
3.2 Legal institutions: laws, rights, contracts	30
3.3 Economic institutions	31
4 Implicitly emerging institutions	31
4.1 Social norms and conventions	32
4.2 Social concepts and attitudes	33
5 Demarcating our notion of institution	35
5.1 The mechanical and motivational side of institutions	35
5.2 Our notion of institution vs. the game-theoretic notion	36
II Value theories of institutions	38
6 Types of value theory: a preview	38
6.1 Principle-based vs. thesis-based theories	38
6.2 A diagram of possible value theories	40

6.3	From evaluating institutions to choosing or designing institutions	41
7	The three levels of a value theory	43
7.1	The domain of a value theory	43
7.2	The three levels: evaluation principle, analysis, evaluation . . .	44
7.3	Theories can be incomplete or silent at some levels	46
7.4	What is an evaluation principle?	46
7.5	Value and legitimacy	48
8	Proceduralism	49
8.1	Definition	49
8.2	Level 1: procedural evaluation principles	51
8.3	Level 2: procedural analysis	51
8.4	Level 3: procedural evaluation	53
9	Instrumentalism	53
9.1	Definition	53
9.2	The basic types of Instrumentalism: Consequentialism vs. Pro- cessualism	54
9.3	Radical Instrumentalism	55
9.4	Level 1: Instrumentalist evaluation principles	56
9.5	Level 2: instrumentalist analysis	57
9.6	Level 3: instrumentalist evaluation	59
10	Processualism	60
10.1	Definition	60
10.2	Level 1: processual evaluation principles	64
10.3	Level 2: processual analysis	64
10.4	Level 3: processual evaluation	67
11	Epistemism	69
11.1	Definition	69
11.2	Two basic types of Epistemism: Knowledge-adaptivism vs. Knowledge-generativism	77
11.3	Level 1: evaluation principles for Epistemism	79
11.4	Level 2: epistemic analysis	85
11.5	Level 3: epistemic evaluation	88
12	Contextualising value theories	88
12.1	Contextualisation by contextualising its evaluation principle . .	89
12.2	Contextualisation by limiting the theory to a given context . .	90

III	Generativism	92
13	Definition and first discussion	93
13.1	Beyond Epistemism: from knowledge to general mental features	93
13.2	Mental features: concepts, attitudes, feelings, and abilities . . .	94
13.3	Definition of Generativism	96
13.4	Why the label ‘generative’?	99
13.5	Generative vs. direct effects of institutions	100
13.6	Generative effects of institution-existence or institution-activity	101
13.7	Deep vs. Shallow Generativism	102
14	Objections to Generativism and Replies	104
14.1	Is Generativism Illiberal?	104
14.2	Is Generativism Paternalist?	105
14.3	Does Generativism instrumentalise people?	107
15	Many Theories lead to Generativism	110
15.1	Consequentialist and processual theories	111
15.2	Further examples: Liberalism and Paternalism	113
15.3	The exact relation between Generativism and standard ap- proaches	114
16	The three levels of a generative theory	115
16.1	Level 1: evaluation principles for Generativism	116
16.2	Level 2: generative analysis of institutions	116
16.3	Level 3: generative evaluation of institutions	118
17	The causal effect of institutions unfolded	118
17.1	The effect in a simple model	119
17.2	The effect in a holistic model	120
17.3	The effect in a long-horizon model	124
17.4	Generative vs. direct effect reconsidered	129
17.5	Neglecting mental change: symptom or cause of a myopic modelling practice?	132
17.6	Uncertainty about effects	135
IV	The Institutional Dilemma	137
18	Generativism versus Adaptivism	137
18.1	Adaptivism	137
18.2	Rousseau, Cohen, Rawls: generative and adaptive echoes . . .	139

19 The Institutional Dilemma: design institutions to fit minds or to change minds?	141
19.1 The Dilemma	141
19.2 Direct Democracy: bad fit but good influence?	143
19.3 Market economy: good fit but bad influence?	146
19.4 Further Examples of the Dilemma	149
19.5 The structure of the dilemma	150
20 Generativism and Epistemism compared	152
20.1 Epistemism: standard consequentialist vs. general instrumentalist version	152
20.2 Extended Generativism	155
20.3 Extended Generativism generalises Epistemism	156
V A Generative Defence of Democracy	159
21 A Short History of Generative Thinking	159
21.1 Tocqueville and JS Mill	159
21.2 The Dewey-Kitcher Generativism	162
21.3 Participatory Democracy	163
21.4 Generativism and the Stability of Social Orders	164
22 Democratic Superiority?	165
22.1 The Democratic Superiority Thesis	166
22.2 Democratic superiority for specific institutions	167
22.3 Why Non-Generative Defences of Democracy will not Succeed	169
23 An Evaluation Principle	171
23.1 The FJ Principle: Flourishing and Justice	171
23.2 Monism vs. pluralism about value	174
23.3 Flourishing	175
23.4 Justice	179
24 A Generative Analysis and Evaluation of Social Orders	183
24.1 Setting the Stage for the Generative Analysis	183
24.2 Democracy's Effect on Attitudes	185
24.3 Democracy's Effect on Abilities	194
24.4 Democracy's Effect on Concepts and Feelings	198
24.5 Evaluation of Democratic Social Orders	202
24.6 The Performance of Undemocratic Social Orders	203
24.7 The Generative Superiority of Democracy	206

25 The Generative Case in Context	209
25.1 Objections and arguments against democracy	209
25.2 What we Have (not) Shown	211
 VI Formal Analysis	 213
26 Institutional evaluation under certainty	213
26.1 Institutional evaluation formalised – case of certainty	214
26.2 Generative institutional evaluation formalised – case of certainty	217
 27 Applications: evaluating economic institutions	 221
27.1 Basic model ingredients	222
27.2 Generative evaluation of public good provision systems	225
27.3 Generative evaluation of environmental protection systems	228
27.4 Generative evaluation of entire economic orders	231
27.5 The Institutional Dilemma for economic orders revisited	235
 28 Institutional evaluation under uncertainty	 237
28.1 Institutional evaluation formalised – case of uncertainty	238
28.2 Non-generative example: mechanism design in economics	240
28.3 Non-generative example: standard epistemic social choice	243
28.4 Generative evaluation formalised – case of uncertainty	254
28.5 Institutional evaluation under certainty or under uncertainty: how choose between the two models?	256
 29 Applications: generative mechanism design and generative epistemic social choice	 257
29.1 Generative mechanism design	257
29.2 Generative epistemic social choice: a simple model	261
29.3 Generative epistemic social choice: a holistic model	269
 Conclusion	 279